Redistricting and the VRA in 2020

M.V. (Trey) Hood III
University of Georgia

Current State of Affairs

- Section 5
 - Retrogression Standard currently unenforceable
- Section 2
 - The Gingles Standard
 - Prongs
 - Minority Opportunity-to-Elect District
 - Majority-Minority (50.1%)
 - Single Race/Ethnicity
 - [Bartlett v. Strickland (2009)]

Key Terms

- **Legally** Significant Racially Polarized Voting
 - Evidence of both Prongs 2 and 3 of Gingles
- The Double-Bind for States
 - Ignore Section 2 and risk a vote dilution suit
 - Creating VRA minority opportunity-to-elect districts (50%) could invite a Shaw racial predominance suit (14th Amendment)

Recent Case Law

• Bethune-Hill v. Va. State Bd. of Elections

[326 F. Supp. 3d 128 (E.D. Va. 2018)] Virginia Legislative Districts

Covington v. North Carolina

[270 F. Supp.3d 881 (M.D.N.C. 2017)] North Carolina Legislative Districts

Cooper v. Harris

[159 F. Supp. 3d 600 (M.D.N.C. 2016)] North Carolina Congressional Districts

Section 2 in 2020 Redistricting

- Gingles used to evaluate a claim against an existing map.
- In redistricting, Gingles must be applied prospectively.
- Use of race in redistricting in 2020 is a real tightrope—must be narrowly applied and employed with caution.
- Section 2 Analysis for Redistricting must...
 - 1. make comparisons to the benchmark map.
 - 2. be demonstrated to have occurred with forethought.
 - 3. be conducted on a district-by-district basis [no application of a mechanical formula].
 - 4. demonstrate <u>legally</u> significant racially polarized voting.

Legally Significant Racially Polarized Voting

Demonstrate:

- 1. Minority group vote cohesion
 - Clear candidate of choice
 - Note: This could include primary as well as general elections
- 2. White vote cohesion
 - Majority has a different candidate of choice
- 3. Minority candidate of choice is defeated
 - Must be the typical pattern (more often than not)
 - In a prospective redistricting context, one could employ a <u>district functionality analysis</u> to demonstrate this requirement.

Statistical Analysis

- Use aggregate (precinct) data to create statistical estimates of individual-level behavior
 - Voting patterns for various racial/ethnic groups
- Statistical Techniques
 - Ecological Regression or Ecological Inference

Data Required for Analysis

- Precinct-Level Election Returns
 - Both general election and (D) Primary Data
 - Spanning multiple general election cycles
- Racial (Ethnic) Data by Precinct
 - Pennsylvania: VAP from Census
- Prospective Districts
 - Accurate precinct composition of proposed districts
- Precinct Alignment Information
 - How do historic voting precincts comport with current precincts being used for redistricting?